#### UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA AT CHARLESTON

IN RE: BOSTON SCIENTIFIC CORP., PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEM PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION

**MDL No. 2326** 

JOSEPH R. GOODWIN

U.S. DISTRICT JUDGE

THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO

**CIVIL ACTION NOS.** 

2:12-cv-00960; 2:12-cv-04371; 2:12-cv-01104;

2:12-cv-08619; 2:12-cv-01425; 2:12-cv-04735;

2:12-cv-04709; 2:12-cv-04312; 2:12-cv-01138;

2:12-cv-03469; 2:12-cv-04685: 2:12-cv-04540;

2:12-cv-04351; 2:12-cv-04983; 2:12-cv-05144;

2:12-cv-03582; 2:12-cv-01156; 2:12-cv-04418;

2:12-cv-05219; 2:12-cv-06199

#### PRETRIAL ORDER # 26 (Agreed Order Regarding Severance of Actions)

Some complaints in this MDL action join multiple plaintiffs whose only apparent connection with one another is that they were implanted with Boston Scientific Corp. mesh product intended to treat certain conditions of the female pelvic organs. The parties have agreed that multiple plaintiff complaints, except those complaints in which only one individual alleges using a Boston Scientific Corp. product but another derivative plaintiff is named as well (e.g. cases in which a spouse is asserting only a loss of consortium claim), should be severed. Accordingly, to resolve any misjoinder concerns and to facilitate the efficient administration of these actions, it is **ORDERED** as follows:

1. Except for the first named plaintiff (and derivative plaintiff(s) claiming under her, if any) listed in each case in Exhibit A, attached hereto, and any plaintiff(s) who objects to

severance (see paragraph 7) the plaintiffs listed in each case in Exhibit A shall be dismissed without prejudice on January 4, 2013.

- 2. Within thirty (30) days after the entry of this Pretrial Order ("PTO"), each individual plaintiff dismissed pursuant to paragraph 1 of this PTO who did not object to severance and any derivative plaintiff claiming under her, may file an individual severed complaint to continue the prosecution of the claims they alleged in the dismissed civil action. Each such plaintiff may choose to file in this court, a Short Form Complaint in the form available on the court's website.
- 3. Any Short Form Complaint filed by a severed plaintiff must be accompanied by the appropriate filing fee, and assigned a separate civil action number determined by the Clerk.
- 4. Any severed plaintiff who wishes to name as defendants parties who are not listed in the current Master Long Form Complaint as defendants must file an individual complaint in the District Court where such action properly can be filed and await transfer by the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation (the "Panel").
- 5. Any re-filed action (whether filed in another district or in the Southern District of West Virginia) shall refer to the dismissed civil action and its original filing date. This information must be added to the Short Form Complaint immediately under the Civil Action Number or to the style of the long form complaint immediately under the Civil Action Number assigned by the Clerk in the district where the action is filed. (*See* Exhibit B, attached hereto.)
- 6. Any individual Complaint filed within the time provided by this PTO will be deemed to have been filed on and relate back to the original filing date of the applicable multi-plaintiff civil action. Any statute of limitations defense that existed as of the filing dates of the original multi-plaintiff complaints shall be preserved.

7. Any plaintiff(s) in Exhibit A who objects to this PTO must do so within ten (10) days of entry of this PTO or by **January 2, 2013**. Such plaintiff should file her objections in the Southern District of West Virginia in the original multi-plaintiff case, with any objection not to exceed two (2) pages. Any plaintiff(s) who objects shall not be severed until such objection is resolved by the court.

8. The court **DIRECTS** the Clerk to place a copy of this PTO in each re-filed action filed pursuant to this PTO that is directly filed in the Southern District and in each re-filed action filed pursuant to this PTO that is transferred by the Panel on the date the case is opened in the Southern District.

The court **DIRECTS** the Clerk to file a copy of this order in 2:12-md-02326 and in member 2:12-cv-00960; 2:12-cv-04371; 2:12-cv-01104; 2:12-cv-08619; 2:12-cv-01425; 2:12-cv-04735; 2:12-cv-04709; 2:12-cv-04312; 2:12-cv-01138; 2:12-cv-03469; 2:12-cv-04685: 2:12-cv-04540; 2:12-cv-04351; 2:12-cv-04983; 2:12-cv-05144; 2:12-cv-03582; 2:12-cv-01156; 2:12-cv-04418; 2:12-cv-05219; and 12:cv-06199. In cases subsequently filed in this district, a copy of the most recent pretrial order will be provided by the Clerk to counsel appearing in each new action at the time of filing of the complaint. In cases subsequently removed or transferred to this court, a copy of the most recent pretrial order will be provided by the clerk to counsel appearing in each new action upon removal or transfer. It shall be the responsibility of the parties to review and abide by all pretrial orders previously entered by the court. The orders may be accessed through the CM/ECF system or the court's website at ww.wvsd.uscourts.gov.

ENTER: December 18, 2012

Joseph R. Goodwin, Chief Judge

### Agreed to by:

#### /s/ Michael Bonasso

Robert T. Adams, Esq.
Jon A. Strongman, Esq.
Lead Counsel for Defendant Boston Scientific Corp.

and

Michael Bonasso, Esq. Liaison Counsel for Defendant Boston Scientific Corp.

/s/ Aimee Wagstaff

Aimee Wagstaff, Esq.
Plaintiffs' Co-Lead Counsel

## EXHIBIT A

Case Name	Originating Court	Originating Case #	Count of Pltfs	MDL Member #
AMSDEN, Donna, Diane Smith,	USDC, Texas	3:12-cv-	6	2:12-cv-00960
Jodi Blair, Mamie Bobick, Kathy	USDC, Texas	00848	0	2.12-64-00900
Carsins, Diane Bachmann vs.		00040		
Johnson & Johnson, Ethicon,				
Inc., Ethicon Women's Health				
and Urology, Gynecare,				
American Medical Systems, Inc.,				
and Boston Scientific				
Corporation				
AUTRY, Loretta and Gary W.	USDC,	1:12-cv-	7	2:12-cv-04371
Autry, husband & wife, Regina	Tennessee	00224	/	2.12-64-043/1
Crowe and Randall Crowe,	1 cililessee	00224		
husband & wife, Tammy Hughes				
and Donald Hughes, husband & wife, Michelle McLain and Jason				
McLain, husband & wife, Diane				
Sivley, an individual, Yvonne Tory and James R. Tory,				
husband & wife, Mary Ann				
Womac, an individual vs. Boston				
Scientific Corporation, Proxy				
Biomedical, Inc., Proxy				
Biomedical, Ltd., Does 1-40				
BELL, Angela, Brenda Allen,	USDC, Texas	3:12-cv-	4	2:12-cv-01104
Wanda Bissonnette, and Amy	USDC, Texas	00850	4	2.12-CV-01104
Charipar vs. Boston Scientific		00030		
Corporation				
BLANKENSHIP, Mildred,	USDC,	5:12-cv-	2	2:12-cv-08619
Lillian Christine Bierman, and	Louisiana	02764	2	2.12-CV-06019
John Franklin Bierman, Jr., on	Louisiana	02704		
behalf of themselves and all				
others similarly situated vs.				
Boston Scientific, Inc.				
	USDC,	0:12-cv-	2	2:12-cv-01425
CARLISLE, Audrey and Benny Carlisle, husband and wife;	Minnesota	0:12-60-		2.12-CV-U1423
Melissa Rodriguez, an individual	rymmesota	00909		
vs. American Medial Systems,				
Inc. and Boston Scientific				
Corporation				
Corporation			1	

COOPER, Annette and Samuel Cooper, Connie Seagraves and Billy Seagraves, Candy Gullatta, Annie Mason and John Mason, Pamela Bowman, Lynda Harris, Carlotta Brdar and Curtis Brdar, Pam Godley and William Godley, Kathy Venegas, Carolyn Naylor and Paul Naylor vs. American Medical Systems, Inc., Endo Pharmaceuticals, Boston Scientific Corporation (d/b/a Boston Scientific Gynecology/Urology)	USDC, Tennessee	2:12-cv- 04183	11	2:12-cv-04735
CROUNSE, Kathryn, an Individual, Roberta Graves, an Individual, Kathy Isbell, an Individual, Virginia Myers and Arthur Myers, husband and wife vs. American Medical Systems, Inc., American Medical Systems Holdings, Inc., Endo Pharmaceuticals, Inc., Endo Pharmaceuticals Holdings, Inc., Endo Health Solutions, Inc., Boston Scientific Corporation, Does 1-40	USDC, Tennessee	2:12-cv- 00285	4	2:12-cv-04709
DILLANDER, Rebecca, an individual, Brenda Joyce Morris and Wallace Morris, husband and wife vs. Boston Scientific Corporation, a Delaware Corporation, and Does 1-40, inclusive	USDC, Kentucky	5:12-cv- 00226	2	2:12-cv-04312
DUGDALE, Janet, Patricia Keay, Lukeysey A. Olatunju, Betty Willis, and Albee Willis vs. Boston Scientific Corporation, Johnson & Johnson, Ethicon, Inc., Ethicon Women's Health and Urology, Gynecare, and American Medical Systems, Inc.	USDC, Wisconsin	2:12-cv- 00278	4	2:12-cv-01138

EPPERSON, Renee, Gary Epperson, Raymond Proctor, Jenette Adams, R'Lena Blank, John Blank, Carolyn Evans Butler, Dorothy Carpenter, Tonya Medley, Sandra Tilley, Ronald Tilley, Linnie Toh, Tze- Chuen Toh, Frances Vargas, and Paul Vargas vs. Boston Scientific Corporation, American Medical Systems, Inc., C.R. Bard, Inc., Johnson & Johnson, Ethicon, Inc., Ethicon Women's Health and Urology, and	USDC, Texas	3:12-cv- 02097	9	2:12-cv-03469
Gynecare GREER, Monica and Sara	USDC,	3:12-cv-	2	2:12-cv-04685
Moffett, on behalf of themselves	Kentucky	00460	_	
and all others similarly situated,	-			
and David A. Konich vs. Boston				
Scientific Corporation, d/b/a				
Mansfield Scientific, Inc. &				
Microvasive, Inc.	****	0.10		0.15.10
JACKEY, Lucinda and Victor	USDC,	3:12-cv-	2	2:12-cv-04540
Jackey, husband and wife, Linda	Kentucky	00417		
Mease, an individual vs. Boston				
Scientific Corporation, a				
Delaware Corporation, and Does				
1-40, inclusive	Haba	2.12	2	0.10 0.4051
LASH, Tori and John Lash,	USDC,	2:12-cv-	2	2:12-cv-04351
husband and wife, Dina	Tennessee	00287		
Gillespie, an Individual vs.				
Boston Scientific Corporation, a				
Delaware Corporation, Does 1-				
40, Inclusive				

LUNDY, Jennifer, Patricia Alvey, William Alvey, Freida Davis, Katrina Duplass, Deborah Henzel, Carl Henzel, Cheryl Hislop, Roosevelt Sims, Jr., Chastity Jones, Lisa Jones, Deborah Legut, Michael Legut, Brenda Likens, Elizabeth Longino, Dawn Mackie, Richard Mackie, Marynell McAlister, Melissa Moreno-Matos, Sean Matos, Patricia Odom, Michelle Ross, David C. Ross, Sr., Helen Smith, Sheila Thomas, Linda Thompson, Patricia Wangerin, Thomas Wangerin, Kristina Wilken, Mark Wilken, Tina Williams, and Philip Williams vs. Boston Scientific Corporation, American Medical Systems, Inc., and C.R. Bard, Inc.	USDC, Texas	3:12-cv- 02908	22	2:12-cv-04983
MITEMA, Sonja, Brenda Bowling, Jennifer Brown, Karen Chappell, Shyrell Copas, Doris Evans, Rebecca Hogan, Mardell Mullins, Lena Reed, Russell Reed, Brenda Rogers, Cheryl Rougeou-Carter, Carol Edward Carter, Martha Russell, David Russell, Angela Stanton, Gordon Stanton, Brenda Ann Thompson, and Walter Thompson vs. Johnson & Johnson, Ethicon, Inc., Ethicon Women's Health and Urology, Gynecare, American Medical Systems, Inc., and Boston Scientific Corporation	USDC, Texas	3:12-cv- 02838	14	2:12-cv-05144

RAMIREZ, Patricia, Carol	USDC, Texas	3:12-cv-	20	2:12-cv-03582
Addington, Frances Altheide,		02095		
George Altheide, Karen Bass				
Brubaker; Ronda Bennett,				
Carlotta Biggs, Harold Wayne				
Biggs, Violet Fisher; Juanita				
Gardner; Samuel Gardner; Mary				
Goodlett; Melody Key, Michael				
Key; Carol Kiern; Richard Kiern,				
Jr.; Brenda King, Charlene				
Longmire, Susan Lord, Sarita				
McNair, Solio Barrera; Rhonda				
Mills, Vicky Morelock, Ric				
Morelock, Sundye Smith, Retha				
Street, and Pricilla Ward vs.				
Johnson & Johnson, Ethicon,				
Inc., Ethicon Women's Health				
and Urology, Gynecare,				
American Medical Systems, Inc.,				
and Boston Scientific				
Corporation				
SAMPUDA, Carla and George	USDC,	2:12-cv-	3	2:12-cv-01156
Sampuda, Husband and Wife,	Tennessee	01156		
Peggy Perry and Richard Perry,				
Husband and Wife, Linda				
Bryant, an Individual vs. Boston				
Scientific Corporation, a				
Delaware Corporation, Does 1-				
40, Inclusive				2.12
SCHULTZ, Katherine and	USDC,	2:12-cv-	3	2:12-cv-04418
Robert Schultz, Sr. Husband and	Tennessee	02575		
Wife, Rebecca Berry, and				
Individual, Betty McDaniel, an				
Individual vs. Boston Scientific				
Corporation, a Delaware				
Corporation, Does 1-40,				
Inclusive	Haba	1 10	2	2.12 05210
THOMPSON, Connie and Linda	USDC,	1:12-cv-	2	2:12-cv-05219
Walker-Burnie, on behalf of	Tennessee	00281		
themselves and all others				
similarly situated vs. Boston				
Scientific, d/b/a Mansfield				
Scientific, Inc., and Microvasive,				
Inc.				

TORRES-ORTIZ, Annette,	USDC,	3:12-cv-	5	2:12-cv-06199
Elizabeth Marquez, Evelyn	Puerto Rico	01746		
Maldonado, Olga Mercedes Soto				
Ramirez, Nixa Jimenez Ortiz and				
Luis Velez and Richard Zayas on				
behalf of themselves and all				
others similarly situated vs.				
Johnson & Johnson, Inc.;				
Johnson & Johnson Services,				
Inc.; Johnson & Johnson				
International; Ethicon, Inc.;				
Ethicon Women's Health and				
Urology, and Gynecare, Boston				
Scientific, D/B/A Mansfield				
Scientific, Inc. and Microvasive,				
Inc., American Medical Systems,				
Inc., American Medical Systems				
Holdings, Inc., Endo				
Pharmaceuticals, and Endo				
Pharmaceutical Holdings, Inc.				
Totals:			126	

#### **EXHIBIT B**

#### I. For Directly Filed Cases:

# UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA

#### **CHARLESTON DIVISION**

IN RE: BOSTON SCIENTIFIC CORP., PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEM PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION
MDL 2326

Civil Action No.		
(Severed from Civil Action No	filed	)

**SHORT FORM COMPLAINT** 

### **II.** For All Other Cases:

# UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA

JANE SMITH,	
Plaintiff,	
v.	Civil Action No (Severed from Civil Action No. filed )
BOSTON SCIENTIFIC CORP., ET AL.,	,
Defendants.	

COMPLAINT AND JURY DEMAND